



**REGULAR MEETING OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES
NOVEMBER 19, 2014**

**WILLIAM G. PORTER BOARDROOM
33 N. HIGH STREET**

REVISED MINUTES

1. **CALL TO ORDER**

Vice Chair, Cleve Ricksecker, called the Board of Trustees meeting to order at 8:16 a.m.

2. **OATH OF OFFICE**

Gina R. Ormond was sworn into office by Vice Chair, Cleve Ricksecker. Ms. Ormond was appointed by the City of Columbus. Her term expires April, 2017. She is Vice President-Associate General Counsel at Nationwide Realty Investors.

3. **ROLL CALL**

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

Dawn Tyler Lee, Chair
J. Cleve Ricksecker, Vice Chair
William A. Anthony, Jr.
Jennifer L. Brunner
James E. Daley
Mabel G. Freeman, Ph.D.
Gina Ormond
Harry Proctor
Craig P. Treneff
Richard R. Zitzke

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT:

James E. Kunk
Jean Carter Ryan

4. **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

Treneff motioned to approve the agenda. Ricksecker seconded the motion. Motion passed.

5. **APPROVAL OF OCTOBER 22, 2014 REGULAR BOARD OF TRUSTEES MEETING MINUTES**

Daley motioned to approve the agenda. Treneff seconded the motion. Motion passed.

6. **COMMENTS OR STATEMENTS FROM THE AUDIENCE**

There were no comments from the audience.

7. PRESIDENT'S REPORT

• 2014-68 – COMMENDING JENNIFER L. BRUNNER

Jennifer L. Brunner was recognized for her service on the COTA Board. She resigned effective November 30, 2014 due to her appointment to the Ohio Tenth District Court of Appeals. Chair Tyler Lee read the resolution commending Ms. Brunner. Brunner was appointed to the Central Ohio Transit Authority Board of Trustees in January, 2014. She has served the Central Ohio Transit Authority as member of the Communications/Marketing Committee and member of the Planning Committee.

Proctor motioned to approve this resolution. Anthony seconded the motion. Motion passed.

8. COMMITTEES:

A. HUMAN RESOURCES COMMITTEE – HARRY W. PROCTOR, CHAIR

2014-70 - AUTHORIZING A REVISION TO THE CONTRACT WITH MEDICAL MUTUAL OF OHIO, INC. FOR AN EMPLOYEE MEDICAL/PHARMACY/DENTAL/VISION INSURANCE PROGRAM

Kristen Treadway, Vice President, Human Resources presented this resolution. She said the current contract with Medical Mutual of Ohio, Inc. expires December 31, 2014. There are currently sixty-six additional people enrolled on COTA's insurance plan as compared to the enrollment numbers at the time the contract was approved. Treadway said the previously approved amount is not sufficient to continue benefits for COTA's employees through December 31, 2014 and an additional \$705,387.76 is required.

This resolution authorizes COTA to allocate the additional funds necessary for an employee medical/pharmacy/dental/vision insurance program provided by Medical Mutual of Ohio for an estimated additional expenditure not to exceed Seven Hundred Five Thousand Three Hundred Eighty-Seven and 76/100 Dollars (\$705,387.76), resulting in a total contract value of Thirteen Million One Hundred Thirty-Six Thousand Three Hundred Eighty-Six and 00/100 Dollars (\$13,136,386).

Freeman motioned to approve this resolution. Ricksecker seconded the motion. Motion passed.

B. OPERATIONS COMMITTEE – WILLIAM A. ANTHONY, CHAIR

Craig Treneff chaired the Operations Committee in the absence of William Anthony.

2014-71 - AUTHORIZING A CONTRACT WITH PREVOST CAR US FOR THE PURCHASE OF MISCELLANEOUS PARTS FOR TRANSIT COACHES

Clinton Forbes, Vice President, Operations, requested to present Resolutions 2014-71 through 2014-76 as a consent agenda as they are all routine parts resolutions. Treneff approved Forbes' request. This resolution authorizes COTA to enter into a contract with Prevost Car US for the purchase of miscellaneous parts for transit coaches for a total expenditure not to exceed Two

Hundred Twenty-Five Thousand Nine Hundred Seventy-Four and 76/100 Dollars (\$225,974.76). Payment for this contract will be from local funds from the Operations Division's 2015 operating budget.

Proctor motioned to approve this resolution. Freeman seconded the motion. Motion passed.

2014-72 - AUTHORIZING A CONTRACT WITH GILLIG, LLC FOR THE PURCHASE OF MISCELLANEOUS PARTS FOR TRANSIT COACHES

This resolution authorizes COTA to enter into a contract with Gillig, LLC for the purchase of miscellaneous parts for transit coaches for a total expenditure not to exceed Three Hundred Fourteen Thousand Twenty-Nine and 36/100 Dollars (\$314,029.36) for the period commencing January 1, 2015 and expiring December 31, 2015. The contract will be paid from local funds from the Operations Division's 2015 operating budget.

Proctor motioned to approve this resolution. Freeman seconded the motion. Motion passed.

2014-73 - AUTHORIZING A CONTRACT WITH MUNCIE TRANSIT SUPPLY FOR THE PURCHASE OF MISCELLANEOUS PARTS FOR TRANSIT COACHES

This resolution authorizes COTA to enter into a contract with Muncie Transit Supply for the purchase of miscellaneous parts for transit coaches for a total expenditure not to exceed One Hundred Ten Thousand Two Hundred Eighty-Nine and 40/100 Dollars (\$110,289.40) for the period commencing January 1, 2015 and expiring December 31, 2015. The contract will be paid from local funds from the Operations Division's 2015 operating budget.

Proctor motioned to approve this resolution. Freeman seconded the motion. Motion passed.

2014-74 - AUTHORIZING A CONTRACT WITH NABI PARTS, LLC FOR THE PURCHASE OF MISCELLANEOUS PARTS FOR TRANSIT COACHES

This resolution authorizes COTA to enter into a contract with NABI Parts, LLC for the purchase of miscellaneous parts for transit coaches for a total expenditure not to exceed Three Hundred Forty-Nine Thousand Ninety-Six and 25/100 Dollars (\$349,096.25) for the period commencing January 1, 2015 and expiring December 31, 2015.

Proctor motioned to approve this resolution. Freeman seconded the motion. Motion passed.

2014-75 - AUTHORIZING A CONTRACT WITH NEW FLYER INDUSTRIES CANADA ULC FOR THE PURCHASE OF MISCELLANEOUS PARTS FOR TRANSIT COACHES

This resolution authorizes COTA to enter into a contract with New Flyer Industries Canada ULC for the purchase of miscellaneous parts for transit coaches for a total expenditure not to exceed One Hundred Seventeen Thousand Four Hundred Fifty-Nine and 82/100 Dollars (\$117,459.82) for the period commencing January 1, 2015 and expiring December 31, 2015. The contract will be paid from local funds from the Operations Division's 2015 operating budget.

Proctor motioned to approve this resolution. Freeman seconded the motion. Motion passed.

2014-76 - AUTHORIZING A CONTRACT WITH CUMMINS BRIDGEWAY, LLC FOR THE PURCHASE OF MISCELLEANOUS CUMMINS PARTS FOR TRANSIT COACHES

This resolution authorizes COTA to enter into a requirements contract with Cummins Bridgeway, LLC for the purchase of parts for Cummins engines for a total expenditure not to exceed Two Hundred Eighty-Four Thousand Eighty-One and 28/100 Dollars (\$284,081.28) for the period commencing January 1, 2015 and expiring December 31, 2015. The contract will be paid from local funds from the Operations Division's 2015 operating budget.

Proctor motioned to approve this resolution. Freeman seconded the motion. Motion passed.

2014-77 - AUTHORIZING EXPENDITURES FOR THE PURCHASE OF SERVICES FROM THE COLUMBUS POLICE DEPARTMENT

Glenn Taylor, Director of Security, presented this resolution. He said COTA uses special duty police officers from the Columbus Police Department as a part of its overall security program. These officers patrol bus routes, remove unauthorized personnel from COTA buses, facilities and shelters and respond to distress calls from COTA operators. They also perform traffic control duties at special events involving COTA such as Red, White and Boom, OSU football shuttle service and other events or incidents as needed. Undercover officers and uniformed officers assist with internal/external investigations, ride onboard COTA coaches and monitor the behavior of disruptive passengers. Columbus Police have the authority to detain or apprehend individuals who refuse to render proper fares, cause disturbances or assault other passengers or COTA employees. Columbus Police have joint jurisdiction with surrounding jurisdictions to perform apprehensions while performing duties for COTA. The cost of these services is based on hourly rates that are published by the Columbus Police Department. This contract is for a one-year period commencing January 1, 2015 and expiring December 31, 2015, for an estimated expenditure not to exceed Six Hundred Sixty-One Thousand and 00/100 Dollars (\$661,000).

Taylor said COTA wants to ramp up services since we are seeing an increase of about 20% in incidents this last year. Freeman asked if we have a sense of why there is a 20% increase in incidents. Taylor said we are seeing an increase in stolen cell phones and other incidences which vary from day to day.

Ricksecker motioned to approve this resolution. Proctor seconded the motion. Zitzke abstained. Motion passed.

C. PLANNING COMMITTEE – DR. MABEL G. FREEMAN, CHAIR

- PRESENTATION ON THE TRANSIT SYSTEM REVIEW - MICHAEL BRADLEY, VICE PRESIDENT, PLANNING & SERVICE DEVELOPMENT

Michael Bradley provided a presentation on the Transit System Review.

2014-78 – ACCEPTANCE OF THE TRANSIT SYSTEM REVIEW FINAL REPORT AND ADOPTION OF A 70 PERCENT RIDERSHIP/30 PERCENT COVERAGE TRANSIT NETWORK FRAMEWORK

Michael Bradley, Vice President, Planning & Service Development presented this resolution. He said in September 2013, COTA's Board of Trustees approved Resolution 2013-66 to enter into a contract with IBI Group Inc. to conduct a review of COTA's bus network, entitled the Transit System Review (TSR), and provide recommendations for improvements to its bus network to better meet the needs of the central Ohio community. IBI Group Inc. delivered a TSR Final Report developed through public and stakeholder engagement. The Final Report recommends a transit network plan framework allocating seventy (70) percent of bus service to high-ridership lines and thirty (30) percent of bus service to coverage lines to serve as a guideline for the allocation of resources for fixed-route bus service hours. The key to the plan is increasing the number of high-frequency lines that arrive at stops every 15 minutes. COTA has six such lines now, but the plan calls for doubling that. Weekend service would match weekdays under the plan, Bradley said. The plan also calls for fewer express lines with more frequent trips. The proposed transit network plan is constrained by COTA's current funding levels and assumes a projected annual service level of 1,162,000 hours by calendar year 2017. Bradley said staff proposes phasing implementation of the proposed transit network plan in January 2015, with an estimated completion date of May 2017. Staff will continue to solicit public and stakeholder input prior to implementation of any changes in the proposed bus network plan and will continue to provide updates to the Board of Trustees on the progress of implementation.

This resolution authorizes COTA to adopt a transit network framework allocating seventy (70) percent of bus service to high-ridership lines and thirty (30) percent of bus service to coverage lines to serve as a guideline for allocation of resources for fixed-route bus service hours.

Trustee Mable Freeman said she wants to make it clear that trustees are adopting the report only today. Trustee Cleve Ricksecker said it is a very smart plan but he is disappointed in how the plan addresses Downtown and skeptical that transfers would be reduced. He said COTA needs to look at alternatives to keeping some express service on High Street and moving some local lines away from High Street. Chair Dawn Tyler Lee asked that the Transit System Review presentation be distributed to all Trustees. She expressed her thanks to staff for all the work put into the Transit System Review. She said the plan may not be perfect, but we can improve service and make adjustments as we move along.

Ricksecker motioned to approve this resolution. Daley seconded the motion. Motion passed.

- PRESENTATION ON THE CMAX – CLEVELAND AVENUE BUS RAPID TRANSIT (BRT) PROJECT – MICHAEL MCCANN, DIRECTOR, PLANNING & SERVICE DEVELOPMENT

Michael McCann provided a presentation on the CMAX-Cleveland Avenue Bus Rapid Transit project. He said the Leadership Team has approved the name CMAX for the Cleveland Avenue BRT project. McCann said the bus has not been designed yet.

2014-79 - AUTHORIZING EXPENDITURES FOR THE CONTRACT WITH HDR ENGINEERING, INC. FOR FINAL DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION ADMINISTRATION SERVICES FOR THE CMAX - CLEVELAND AVENUE BUS RAPID TRANSIT (BRT) ROUTE

Michael Bradley, Vice President, Planning & Service Development, presented this resolution. He said Resolution No. 2013-73 authorized a contract with HDR Engineering, Inc. for environmental and preliminary engineering services for the CMAX - Cleveland Avenue Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) route for Tasks 1 and 2, respectively, and the contract included provisions to continue the work to include final design (Task 3) and construction administration (Task 4) upon receipt of FTA approvals (including environmental clearance). Approvals have now been received and COTA wishes to proceed with the final design and construction administration services for the CMAX - Cleveland Avenue BRT Project at a total cost not to exceed \$2,504,864.

This resolution authorizes COTA to increase the value of the contract with HDR Engineering, Inc. for the CMAX - Cleveland Avenue BRT Project by a total not to exceed Two Million Five Hundred Four Thousand Eight Hundred Sixty-Four and 00/100 Dollars (\$2,504,864) for the provision of final design and construction administration services, from a total not to exceed One Million Nine Hundred Four Thousand Eight Hundred Ninety-Nine (\$1,904,899) to a total not to exceed Four Million Four Hundred Nine Thousand Seven Hundred Sixty-Three and 00/100 Dollars (\$4,409,763).

Treneff motioned to approve this resolution. Ricksecker seconded the motion. Motion passed.

2014-80 - AUTHORIZING A CONTRACT WITH NELSON/NYGAARD CONSULTING ASSOCIATES, INC. FOR CONSULTING SERVICES TO DEVELOP COTA'S NEXT GENERATION PLAN

Michael Bradley, Vice President, Planning & Service Development, presented this resolution. He said while the Transit System Review (TSR) addressed COTA's service planning needs through 2017 for the existing bus network, the Next Generation Plan 2050 will build upon the foundation of the TSR and seek public involvement to develop a long-range vision for the future of transit in central Ohio through the year 2050. The process will be unconstrained fiscally and open to all modes of transit service. The general public, stakeholders, elected officials, business leaders, COTA passengers, and others will have the opportunity to participate in shaping the development of the plan through a significant public engagement process.

The plan will use results from MORPC's insight2050 study, which projects the population of central Ohio to grow by over 500,000 residents, 300,000 jobs, and 304,000 new homes by 2050 as a basis for development of the plan.

This resolution authorizes COTA to enter into a contract with Nelson/Nygaard Consulting Associates, Inc. for consulting services to develop COTA's Next Generation Plan for a total expenditure not to exceed Seven Hundred Forty-Thousand Nine Hundred Eighty-Three and 00/100 Dollars (\$740,983).

Treneff motioned to approve this resolution. Daley seconded the motion. Motion passed.

D. FINANCE/AUDIT COMMITTEE – JAMES E. KUNK, CHAIR

2014-81 - AUTHORIZING THE CENTRAL OHIO TRANSIT AUTHORITY TO PARTICIPATE IN THE OHIO DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION COOPERATIVE PURCHASING PROGRAM

Jeffrey Vosler, Director of Finance, presented this resolution. He said this resolution authorizes COTA to participate in intergovernmental contracts initiated by Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT) for the purchase of machinery, materials, supplies and other articles. This program offers COTA the benefits and cost savings of purchasing through ODOT term contracts. ODOT requires that entities participating in the program obtain authorization from their controlling boards and file a certified copy of the resolution authorizing this participation with ODOT every two years.

Freeman motioned to approve this resolution. Ricksecker seconded the motion. Motion passed.

2014-82 - AUTHORIZING ADDITIONAL EXPENDITURES FOR THE CONTRACT WITH SHAW ENVIRONMENTAL & INFRASTRUCTURE, INC. FOR ENVIRONMENTAL CONSULTING SERVICES

Jeffrey Vosler, Director of Finance, presented this resolution. He said this resolution authorizes the President/CEO to increase the value of the contract with Shaw Environmental & Infrastructure, Inc. for environmental consulting services by Two Hundred Sixty Three Thousand and 00/100 Dollars (\$263,000) from a total not to exceed Nine Hundred Thousand and 00/100 Dollars (\$900,000) to a total not to exceed One Million One Hundred Sixty-Three Thousand and 00/100 Dollars (\$1,163,000). Additional funds are required to meet the anticipated requirements through the remainder of the contract.

Ricksecker motioned to approve this resolution. Freeman seconded the motion. Motion passed.

2014-83 - AUTHORIZING THE FILING OF APPLICATIONS WITH THE OHIO DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION FOR GRANTS FOR FISCAL YEAR 2015

Jeffrey Vosler, Director of Finance, presented this resolution. He said COTA is eligible to participate in public transportation systems assistance grant programs sponsored by the Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT) from the State of Ohio, through the Fiscal Year 2015 programs. ODOT requires that COTA's application for grant funds be accompanied with an authorizing Resolution passed by the Board. The attached Resolution conforms to the format required in ODOT's 2015 Grant Application Criteria and, if approved, will allow COTA to participate in ODOT's Fiscal Year 2015 funding programs.

This resolution authorizes COTA to file an application and execute contracts for the Fiscal Year 2015 ODOT grant programs, including, the Urban Transit Program, Ohio Transit Preservation Partnership Program, and other available discretionary grant programs on behalf of COTA.

Ricksecker motioned to approve this resolution. Treneff seconded the motion. Motion passed.

2014-84 - AUTHORIZING A CONTRACT WITH GOLON, INC. FOR THE COTA COMMONS TRANSIT TERMINAL FLOOR TILE REPLACEMENT

Jeffrey Vosler, Director of Finance, presented this resolution. He said this resolution authorizes COTA to enter into a contract with Golon, Inc. for the replacement of the floor tile for the COTA Commons Transit Terminal for a total expenditure of One Hundred Eighty-Nine Thousand Four Hundred Sixty-Five and 00/100 Dollars (\$189,465). The purpose of this contract is to complete improvements to COTA's Downtown Transit Terminal located at 25 East Rich Street.

Treneff motioned to approve this resolution. Proctor seconded the motion. Motion passed.

2014-85 – ADOPTING A REVISED FARE STRUCTURE

President Curtis Stitt presented this resolution. He said COTA and its Board of Trustees recognize their responsibility to the public to establish and maintain an equitable fare structure. The Board has established a target farebox recovery ratio of 20% to be considered along with affordability and other criteria. In accordance with policy, staff evaluates possible fare structure changes every three years. COTA management has conducted public meetings pursuant to COTA's Public Comment Process for Service Changes Policy, and actively solicited public comments and has given consideration to the fare structure. This resolution authorizes COTA to maintain the current fare structure for all fares for 2015, except for a reduction in ADA fares and an extension of free fares through March 3, 2015 on the Downtown Circulator (CBUS). Staff recommends to restore free fares for ADA customers on fixed route service. After the fare was increased to \$1.00 three years ago during the last fare adjustment, ADA ridership on fixed route service declined significantly. This resolution also authorizes COTA to extend the free fare for the CBUS Downtown Circulator service through May 3, 2015, while we continue to investigate obtaining support from Downtown businesses for the cost of this service.

Freeman motioned to approve this resolution. Ricksecker seconded the motion. Motion passed.

- PRELIMINARY 2015 BUDGET PRESENTATION

Jeffrey Vosler provided a presentation on the 2015 budget. He said we are still projecting to end 2014 approximately one million under budget. Vosler reviewed the 2015 budget assumptions: The operating environment continues with uncertainty. National and local economy continues to rebound. Local unemployment has fallen to 5.7% compared to the national average of 7.1%. Inflation is expected to remain relatively low, estimated at 2.3%. COTA's energy prices are controlled through participation in energy price risk management programs. Service level growth will be up 7.2% in 2015. The final health insurance impact report, based on bio-metric results and a 2.5% increase in premiums, is due to COTA on December 10.

2015 major project initiatives supported in the 2015 budget are as follows:

- CAD/AVL System
- Real-time
- BRT Phase III – Final Design
- McKinley Avenue Phase III Renovation

